United Nations E/CN.17/1999/16

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
12 March 1999

Original: English

Commission on Sustainable Development
Seventh session
19–30 April 1999

Report of the Inter-sessional Ad Hoc Working Group on Consumption and Production Patterns and on Tourism

(New York, 22–26 February 1999)

Contents

		Paragraphs	*Page*
	Introduction	1	2
I.	Changing consumption and production patterns	2–56	2
	A. Possible elements for a draft decision of the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session	2	2
	B. Co-Chairmen's summary of the discussions	3–56	5
II.	Tourism and sustainable development	57–96	12
	A. Possible elements for a draft decision/resolution by the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session	57	12
	B. Co-Chairmen's summary of the discussions	58–96	14
III.	Adoption of the report of the Working Group	97–98	20
IV.	Organizational and other matters	99–104	20
	A. Opening and duration of the session	99–100	20
	B. Attendance	101	20
	C. Election of officers	102	21
	D. Agenda and organization of work	103	21
	E. Documentation	104	21

99-06921 (E) 260399

Introduction

1. The role of the ad hoc working groups of the Commission on Sustainable Development was to serve as a preparatory meeting for the seventh session of the Commission and to facilitate the Commission's achieving tangible, action-oriented results on the issues of changing consumption and production patterns and of tourism and sustainable development. As agreed by the Inter-sessional Ad Hoc Working Group on Consumption and Production Patterns and on Tourism, the meeting produced two types of documents on both substantive items in its agenda. These documents were prepared by the Co-Chairmen of the Working Group on the basis of the discussions held during the meeting and comments made and proposals submitted by the participants on the preliminary drafts, but were not formally negotiated. The documents are:

(a) The possible elements for draft decisions/resolutions which could serve as a starting point for further deliberations and negotiations during the seventh session of the Commission on Sustainable Development. The format of the possible elements for a draft decision/resolution on sustainable tourism development, however, will not create a precedent for the future work of the Commission. It is expected that delegations and groups will further study these documents in the period between the meeting of the ad hoc working groups and the session of the Commission with a view to formulating their positions in preparation for negotiations in the drafting groups during the session of the Commission;

(b) The Co-Chairmen's summaries of the discussions which attempt to reflect the overall thrust of the discussion in the Working Group, and the main positions stated by delegations and which record, when necessary, alternative views and proposals. These summaries will not be further modified and will be included as reference material on a given issue in the report to the Commission on Sustainable Development.

I. Changing consumption and production patterns

A. Possible elements for a draft decision of the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session

2. The possible elements for a draft decision of the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session on changing consumption and production patterns are the following:

Introduction

1. The principal goals of changing consumption and production patterns should be pursued in full accordance with Agenda 21[1] and paragraph 28 of the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21,[2] taking into account the special situation of developing countries adversely affected by the process. Governments face a collective challenge that requires reaffirmed commitments, strengthened cooperation and greater efforts towards concrete action, taking into account the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities.

---

[1] *Report of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, Rio de Janeiro, 3–14 June 1992*, vol. II, *Resolutions Adopted by the Conference* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.93.I.8 and corrigendum), resolution 1, annex II.

[2] General Assembly resolution S/19-2 of 28 June 1997, annex.

2. Industrialized countries should continue to take the lead in efforts to reverse unsustainable trends in consumption and production, especially those that threaten the global environment. Developing countries' priorities are to eradicate poverty and improve standards of living, including meeting basic needs, with international assistance, while avoiding environmental damage and social inequity. Countries with economies in transition face the challenge of integrating into the reform process policies to make consumption and production patterns more sustainable.

Priorities for future work

3. The Commission on Sustainable Development will continue to address sustainable consumption and production as an overriding issue at its eighth and ninth sessions, in 2000 and 2001 respectively, in particular highlighting the linkages with agriculture, trade and finance in 2000, and energy and transport in 2001. The next comprehensive discussion of sustainable consumption and production patterns will take place at the comprehensive review at the session of the Commission in 2002, in preparation for a ten-year review of progress since the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development.

4. Work under the Commission's international work programme on consumption and production patterns, adopted at its third session in 1995,[3] should continue. In addition, the implementation of the international work programme will incorporate the following four priority areas: (a) effective policy development and implementation; (b) natural resource management and cleaner production; (c) globalization and its impacts on consumption and production patterns; and (d) urbanization and its impacts on consumption and production patterns. Progress on work and concrete results will be reported to the Commission at its tenth session in 2002.

Effective policy development and implementation

5. Governments, in cooperation with international organizations and in partnership with major groups, should:

(a) Further develop policies for promoting sustainable consumption and production patterns through disincentives for unsustainable practices and incentives for more sustainable practices. A policy mix for this purpose could include regulations, economic and social instruments, procurement policies and voluntary agreements and initiatives;

(b) Consider a range of economic instruments, including, *inter alia*, fiscal instruments, and the gradual phasing out of environmentally harmful subsidies, in order to internalize environmental costs and promote sustainable consumption and production. This should be done taking into account social needs and avoiding potential negative effects for market access, in particular for developing countries;

(c) Work to increase understanding of the role of advertising and mass media in shaping consumption and production patterns, and enhance their role in promoting sustainable development, *inter alia*, through voluntary initiatives and agreed guidelines;

[3] See *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1995, Supplement No. 12* (E/1995/32), Chap. I, paras. 45–46.

(d) Develop and implement public awareness programmes with a focus on consumer education and access to information, in particular addressing youth and taking into account gender perspectives.

6. Industrialized countries should promote and facilitate the transfer of skills and environmentally sound technologies, in combination with financial resources, to developing countries so as to foster more sustainable consumption and production patterns.

Natural resource management and cleaner production

7. Governments, in cooperation with international organizations and in partnership with major groups, should:

(a) Develop and apply policies to promote public and private investments in cleaner production and the sustainable use of natural resources, including the transfer of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries and countries with economies in transition;

(b) Collect and disseminate best practice experiences in cleaner production and environmental management;

(c) Undertake further studies and analysis of the costs and benefits of cleaner production, eco-efficiency and demand-side management, and assess the positive and negative impacts on developing countries;

(d) Further develop cleaner production and eco-efficiency policy approaches, through, *inter alia*, environmental management systems, integrated product policies, target-setting, life-cycle management, labelling schemes and performance reporting. Best practices and results should be shared within the wider community and used for capacity-building, in particular in small and medium-sized enterprises, in developing countries and countries with economies in transition;

(e) Engage industries and economic sectors, at the national and international levels, in the debate on sustainable consumption and production with the objective of developing optimal strategies for more sustainable consumption and production.

8. The United Nations Environment Programme and the United Nations Industrial Development Organization should, through their Cleaner Production Centres, continue to support enterprises, in particular small and medium-sized enterprises, in developing countries and countries with economies in transition, especially in the areas of auditing and certification, loan applications and financing, and the marketing of their products on international markets.

Globalization and its impacts on consumption and production patterns

9. Governments, in cooperation with international organizations and in partnership with major groups, should:

(a) Undertake studies of the environmental and social impacts of globalization, including the impact that trade, investment, mass media, advertising and marketing have on the transfer of unsustainable consumption patterns from industrialized to developing countries. The studies should examine ways and means to mitigate negative impacts and use opportunities to promote more sustainable consumption and production patterns;

(b) Undertake studies on the role of the financial services sector in facilitating environmentally and socially responsible investments, and further encourage voluntary initiatives for sustainable development by that sector;

(c) Increase their efforts to make policies on trade and policies on sustainable consumption and production mutually supportive;

(d) Study the values and benefits of traditional lifestyles and cultures for promoting sustainable consumption.

Urbanization and its impacts on consumption and production patterns

10. Governments, in cooperation with international organizations and in partnership with major groups, while taking into account the work of the Commission on Human Settlements, should:

(a) Assess and address the environmental and social impacts of urbanization, in particular those related to energy, transport, sanitation, waste management and public health. Industrialized country experience and resources can help in addressing these issues through strategic land-use and urban planning;

(b) Increase efforts to address the critical issues of fresh water and sanitation in human settlements in developing countries as a priority of the international agenda on sustainable consumption and production;

(c) Assess and address the impacts of urbanization on environmental and social conditions. In-depth studies on the key determining factors of quality of life should be undertaken and used to strengthen urban development strategies.

11. Governments, including local authorities, are invited to incorporate sustainable consumption and production policies in city planning and management and report on experiences to the Commission during the comprehensive review at its tenth session.

12. Governments, local authorities, the private sector, and other stakeholders are urged to cooperate in developing waste collection systems and disposal facilities, and developing programmes for prevention, minimization and recycling of waste, to safeguard and improve the quality of life in human settlements and coastal regions in developing countries. Dissemination of positive results of the implementation of various policy instruments may facilitate the wider application of such policies.

B. Co-Chairmen's summary of the discussions

Introduction

3. The debate on changing consumption and production patterns was based on the report of the Secretary-General (E/CN.17/1999/2) entitled "Comprehensive review of changing consumption and production patterns", in the context of chapter 4 of Agenda 21 and paragraph 28 of the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21, contained in the annex to General Assembly resolution S/19-2 of 28 June 1997.

4. Many delegations from developing and developed countries and countries with economies in transition described activities in their countries promoting sustainable consumption and production patterns. Recent meetings that provided useful contributions to the debate were mentioned, including the Kabelvåg Workshop on "Consumption in a Sustainable World", hosted by Norway in June 1998, and the conference on "Sustainable Consumption Patterns: Trends and Traditions in East Asia" hosted by the Republic of Korea

in January 1999, in cooperation with the United Nations Division for Sustainable Development, and co-sponsored by Sweden and Norway. A number of delegations welcomed the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) *Human Development Report, 1998*,[4] with its focus on consumption and human development, as a contribution to the debate.

General considerations

5. Many delegations stated that unsustainable consumption and production patterns include both adverse environmental impacts arising from the excess consumption of natural resources, particularly in the developed countries, and unemployment, poverty and underconsumption of basic goods and services, particularly in developing countries. They felt it would be useful to have a coordinated programme of national and regional studies concerning destructive patterns of consumption and production, notably in the areas of energy use, transport of waste products and use of renewable and non-renewable natural resources, to assess their sustainability. It was also considered important to ensure a sustainable development agenda for energy that would cover all types of energy and address economic, social and environmental aspects.

6. Many countries stated that achieving sustainable development required a transition to sustainable patterns of production and consumption, particularly in industrialized countries. It was noted that Governments face a collective challenge to strengthen cooperation and make greater efforts towards concrete action, taking into account the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities.

7. Many delegations stated that the biggest challenge for industrialized countries was to minimize the negative effects of consumption and production and to assist developing countries and countries with economies in transition in their efforts. Industrialized countries must therefore continue to take the lead in finding ways to change unsustainable consumption and production patterns.

8. Many delegations felt that the work programme on changing consumption and production patterns as adopted by the Commission at its third session should be implemented and further developed.

9. Many delegations emphasized that consumption and production patterns, together with poverty, are overriding issues for the Commission for the period 1998--2002. The need to change consumption and production patterns towards sustainable development should therefore be addressed in the context of the themes for each session of the Commission, in particular with respect to agriculture in 2000 and energy and transport in 2001.

10. Many delegations stated that changing consumption and production patterns to ensure sustainability should not imply reductions in the quality of life or living standards and should ensure that the basic needs of all people are met.

11. Some delegations noted that increases in consumption in recent decades have improved the welfare of large numbers of people in the world. However, there are enormous, and in many cases widening, disparities in consumption between and within countries. Increased consumption has also, in many cases, resulted in the undermining of the sustainability of development through environmental degradation and resource depletion. The most severe environmental impacts are being felt in the poorest regions of the world.

12. Many delegations stated that Governments should ensure minimum standards of consumption for poor people, with particular attention to nutrition, literacy and education,

[4] New York, Oxford University Press, 1998.

health care, clean drinking water, sanitation and shelter. Improving opportunities for productive employment, particularly in rural areas of developing countries, could contribute to this objective. It was noted that rural communities in developing countries where access to electricity was prohibitively expensive could be supplied with solar energy, thus improving living standards and environmental conditions.

13. One delegation noted that its country had increased consumption in recent decades while reducing pollution through measures such as increased energy and resource efficiency, increased reuse and recycling, increased durability of goods, and improved management of chemicals and waste. Nonetheless, it noted that much more needed to be done to promote environmentally sound and sustainable consumption and production practices.

14. Another delegation noted that unsustainable consumption and production patterns, particularly in developed countries, have produced global environmental degradation, including depletion of fish stocks, deforestation, loss of biodiversity, ozone depletion and the steady accumulation of greenhouse gases.

15. Some delegations stated that a variety of policy instruments should be used to promote sustainable consumption and production patterns, including regulations, economic incentives, ecological tax reform, information and education. It was noted that further work was needed on assessing the effectiveness of policy instruments in providing economic, environmental and social benefits. Further study was also needed to assess the benefits and costs of phasing out environmentally harmful subsidies and introducing environmental taxes and charges more widely, with measures to assist vulnerable groups and enterprises that may be adversely affected. It was proposed that the role of the financial services sector in facilitating environmentally and socially responsible investments deserved further study and analysis.

16. Some delegations stated that development of indicators to measure changes in consumption and production patterns was important for identifying areas where action is needed and assessing the effectiveness of policy measures. It was also stated that, in developing such indicators, consideration must be given to the situation of developing countries, in particular to the satisfaction of basic needs, information availability and accessible methodologies.

17. One delegation stated that information dissemination measures were sometimes insufficient and that a shift to "social system" measures was required.

18. Some delegations stated that Governments should ensure cleaner production and eco-efficiency in their own operations and procurement, and introduce environmental management systems. It was noted that the 1996 Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Council Recommendation on Improving the Environmental Performance of Governments and the Recommendation on Improving the Environmental Performance of OECD were important contributions to this objective.

19. Some delegations noted that sustainable production and consumption, particularly with respect to fossil fuel consumption and its links to climate change and sea-level rise, were of particular concern to small island developing States. Other delegations were of the view that fossil fuel consumption was not the conclusive cause of climate change.

20. Some delegations stated that further efforts were needed to improve access to international markets for products from least developed countries in order to promote sustainable consumption and production in those countries.

21. One delegation stated that work in the area of computer modelling of consumption and production trends should reflect specific consumption and production trends at

subregional and national levels. Such computer models should be used to examine the possible impacts of changes in policy.

22. Many delegations stated that progress towards more sustainable consumption and production, and towards the implementation of the Commission's work programme, would require cooperation among Governments, business and industry, non-governmental organizations and international organizations. Public-private partnerships should be promoted towards this objective.

23. In addition to continuing work on the existing work programme, delegations proposed new priorities and new areas of work as described below.

Natural resource management and cleaner production

24. Many delegations stated that developed countries should encourage the establishment of best practices in cleaner production and environmental management. Developed countries and international organizations should make further efforts towards capacity-building and technology transfer to industrial sectors in developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

25. Many delegations stated that increased efforts were needed to promote and facilitate the transfer of environmentally sound technologies, in combination with financial resources, to developing countries and countries with economies in transition and provide them with technical assistance in support of their national capacity-building programmes. They looked forward to developed countries' meeting their commitments to official development assistance (ODA), leading to more tangible and visible results.

26. Some delegations stated that cleaner production and eco-efficiency, based on improved skills, technologies and efficient use of energy and resources, were essential to sustainable development in both developed and developing countries. In many cases, it was noted, cleaner production provided large economic benefits as well as environmental benefits. It was also noted, however, that these efficiency improvements have generally been outweighed by increased volumes of production and consumption.

27. Some delegations supported the idea of developing national cleaner production and eco-efficiency strategies and setting targets for eco-efficiency adapted to particular sectors, products and processes. Governments, in partnership with industry, should develop and implement comprehensive policy packages including cleaner production, eco-efficiency, life cycle management, product stewardship and pollution prevention. The development and application of integrated product policies was seen as a useful approach to this objective.

28. Many delegations stated that Governments should encourage business and industry to adopt environmental management systems and to publish information on the environmental impacts of their activities. Where possible, they should be encouraged to provide information on the environmental impacts of their goods and services, including the impacts of distribution, use and disposal, as well as production processes.

29. Some delegations stated that business and industry could make important contributions to making consumption and production more sustainable by developing and adopting cleaner production technologies, environmental best practices, environmental management systems, codes of conduct, voluntary guidelines and negotiated agreements. Governments should promote dialogue and partnership with business and industry towards this objective.

30. Some delegations stated that increased research and investment are required to develop more sustainable use of key resources in such areas as energy, transport and water, with a view to improving access for poor people and conserving resources. It was noted that some

Governments were providing financial support for science and technology for sustainability in such areas as energy and agriculture, and for incentives for consumers to improve energy efficiency in homes and transportation.

31. Some delegations stated that regulations and economic incentives, including progressive internalization of environmental costs, should be used to promote cleaner production and eco-efficiency. Many small and medium-sized enterprises would need support from Government and other members of industry in meeting those objectives.

32. Many delegations were of the view that economic instruments and the internalization of environmental costs might constitute a trade restriction and be counter-productive, specifically in regard to the already limited comparative advantages of developing countries, and therefore should be avoided in accordance with the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities.

33. Some delegations stated that voluntary initiatives by the private sector, where appropriate in cooperation with government and non-governmental organizations, could also contribute to changing consumption and production patterns. It was noted that the Commission secretariat, in consultation with other stakeholders, was organizing a multi-stakeholder experts workshop, to be hosted by Canada in March 1999, to identify elements for a review of voluntary initiatives and agreements and to report to the Commission.

34. Many delegations stated that the UNEP/UNIDO Cleaner Production Centres should provide additional support to enterprises, in particular small and medium-sized enterprises, in developing countries and countries with economies in transition, for introducing cleaner production technologies, financing technology transfer and undertaking capacity-building for environmental management, auditing and certification.

35. Some delegations welcomed the International Declaration on Cleaner Production launched by UNEP in October 1998 and invited Governments that had not already done so to sign the Declaration.

Impact of globalization on consumption and production patterns

36. Many delegations noted that consumption and production patterns in developed countries strongly influenced patterns in developing countries, particularly in the context of globalization and trade liberalization. This occurred not only through trade and investment, but also through communication, mass media, advertising and marketing. They stressed that consumption and production patterns in developed countries should not be used to create technical barriers to trade.

37. Some delegations stated that further efforts should be made to identify areas in which changing consumption patterns in developed countries offer opportunities for enterprises in developing countries. It was noted that some developing-country production processes are more environmentally friendly than processes in developed countries.

38. Many delegations stated that trade pressure from developed countries had also contributed to unsustainable consumption practices in developing countries. For example, when developed countries seek, through various means, lower taxes on their exports to developing countries, such as luxury cars, energy-wasting home appliances and other expensive products, they affect the consumption patterns of developing countries. Those delegations recommended that developed countries take steps to harmonize their policies on trade and sustainable development, with particular reference to avoiding the tendency to export unsustainable consumption and production patterns. It was suggested that countries

could consider applying environmental taxes on particular luxury and disposable goods that have negative environmental impacts.

39. Some delegations stated that improvements in eco-efficiency would be beneficial to all countries and that action to promote cleaner production and eco-efficiency should be intensified, but that there might be some negative side effects for countries with a high economic dependence on exports of natural resources.

40. Some delegations noted that economic and social development in oil exporting countries could be adversely affected by measures such as energy taxes and that consideration should be given to the situation of those countries.

41. One delegation stressed the importance of ensuring coherence between multilateral agreements and instruments that address environmental and social standards, and the multilateral trade rules.

42. Many delegations proposed that the role of communications, media and advertising in promoting unsustainable consumption and production patterns and in disseminating consumption and production patterns internationally should be studied. They suggested that agreed guidelines might be considered.

Urbanization

43. Many delegations stated that further efforts are urgently needed to address problems related to transportation and health in human settlements in developing countries, in particular problems of air pollution and traffic congestion. New approaches to urban planning, land-use management and public transportation were needed to address these problems in a comprehensive way.

44. Many delegations noted that waste collection and disposal was a major environmental issue in both developing and developed countries. They noted a need for research and development in waste management systems and for developed-country support in introducing such systems into developing countries. It was stated that waste prevention through cleaner production, reductions in packaging, recycling and reuse, and consumer education and information could make a major contribution to waste management. International exchange of best practices in those areas would be of major importance.

45. Many delegations stated that urban infrastructure for clean drinking water and sanitation in developing countries should be a priority.

46. Many delegations stated that developed-country expertise, technology and financial resources could help in addressing the problems of urban infrastructure development, waste management and comprehensive urban planning in developing countries.

47. Some delegations noted that urban planning and infrastructure development were key determinants of long-term patterns of consumption and production, as they impose constraints on changes in patterns of transportation and consumption of energy, water and materials. Sustainability considerations should be integrated into land-use planning and urban development.

Consumer information and education and social values

48. Some delegations stated that sustainable consumption and production required that technology improvements be complemented by changes in lifestyles and new perceptions of welfare, in particular among affluent consumers in all countries. This required that consumers be active participants in sustainable development efforts.

49. Some delegations stated that information on sustainable consumption and production should be integrated into educational curricula at all levels of education, particularly into professional education.

50. Some delegations stated that eco-labelling and fair trade labelling could assist consumers in taking environmental and social issues into account in their consumption. Such measures, however, should not be disguised barriers to trade. Many delegations cautioned that the concept of eco-labelling and related issues were still under discussion in the Committee on Trade and Environment of the World Trade Organization.

51. One delegation stressed that issues related to eco-labelling should focus only on product characteristics, taking due consideration of discussions in other multilateral forums, such as the World Trade Organization Committee on Trade and Environment, in order to avoid disguised barriers to trade.

52. Some delegations stated that the use of economic policy instruments, including internalization of environmental and social costs, and the phasing out of environmentally harmful subsidies, were also essential in promoting consumer choices that take into account the impact on sustainable development. Many delegations questioned the idea of "social costs" and expressed preference for a reference instead to the social impacts of economic policy instruments.

53. Some delegations stated that further research was needed on consumer behaviour, including the choices made by women, men and children, and of the effect of advertising and the media. The Oxford-based International Commission on Sustainability which is being established to look at the social-cultural dimensions that shape consumption and production patterns should provide a valuable contribution to further consideration of this issue.

54. Some delegations stated that consideration should be given to how elements of traditional knowledge, culture, practices and lifestyles can be combined with modern approaches to promote sustainable consumption and production patterns. Efforts in this area in East Asia should take into account the work of the conference on "Sustainable Consumption Patterns: Trends and Traditions in East Asia" held in the Republic of Korea in January 1999.

55. Many delegations welcomed the agreement in informal consultations on new elements on sustainable consumption for inclusion in the United Nations Guidelines for Consumer Protection.[5]

56. Some delegations stated that consumer information and education were essential for enabling consumers to make informed choices. Consumers should be provided with information on the impacts of consumer behaviour on the environment, health, quality of life and poverty, and with information on alternative consumption possibilities. Governments, in partnership with the business community, consumer organizations and other organizations of civil society, should promote public availability of such information. It was noted that public participation in policy-making at all levels and transparent legislative and regulatory process promote public support of, and participation in, sustainable production and consumption efforts. Public support was needed to strengthen the work of consumer organizations in these areas.

[5] General Assembly resolution 39/248 of 9 April 1985, annex.

II. Tourism and sustainable development

A. Possible elements for a draft decision/resolution by the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session

57. The possible elements for a draft decision/resolution of the Commission on Sustainable Development at its seventh session on tourism and sustainable development are the following:

The Commission on Sustainable Development,

Recalling the outcome of the nineteenth special session of the General Assembly for the overall review and appraisal of the implementation of Agenda 21,[6] at which the Assembly requested the Commission on Sustainable Development to develop an action-oriented international programme of work on sustainable tourism, to be defined in cooperation with the World Tourism Organization, the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, the United Nations Environment Programme, the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity and other relevant bodies; and stressed that policy development and implementation should take place in cooperation with all interested parties, especially with the private sector and local and indigenous communities,[7]

Recalling also that the General Assembly has proclaimed 2002 as the International Year of Ecotourism[8] and as the International Year of Mountains,[9]

1. *Decides* to adopt an international work programme on sustainable tourism development, containing the elements outlined below, to be implemented in the period between the seventh session of the Commission on Sustainable Development and 2002 when the ten-year review of progress achieved since the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development will be carried out;

2. *Calls upon* Governments to advance sustainable tourism development, *inter alia*, through development and implementation of policies and national strategies or master plans for sustainable tourism development based on Agenda 21, which will encourage their tourism industry, assist in attracting foreign direct investment and appropriate environmentally sound technologies and, also, provide focus and direction to all stakeholders, including national tourism councils and the private sector as well as local and indigenous communities;

3. *Encourages* Governments to promote a favourable framework for small and medium-sized enterprises, the main engine for job creation in the tourism sector, by reducing administrative burdens, improving access to capital and providing training in management and other skills;

4. *Calls upon* the tourism industry to develop new forms of socially, culturally and environmentally compatible forms of tourism and to continue the development and use of voluntary initiatives in support of sustainable tourism development;

---

[6] *Report of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, Rio de Janeiro, 3-14 June 1992*, vol. I, *Resolutions Adopted by the Conference* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.93.I.8 and corrigendum), resolution 1, annex II.

[7] General Assembly resolution S/19-2 of 28 June 1997, annex, para. 69.

[8] General Assembly resolution 53/200 of 15 December 1998.

[9] General Assembly resolution 53/24 of 10 November 1998.

5. *Invites* Governments and major groups, as well as the United Nations system, working through the Inter-Agency Committee on Sustainable Development, in close collaboration with the World Tourism Organization, and building on relevant work carried out by the United Nations Environment Programme, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, the International Labour Organization, the United Nations Development Programme, the Convention on Biological Diversity[10] and other relevant organizations, to undertake the following tasks and to keep the Commission on Sustainable Development informed on progress achieved:

(a) To promote long-term sustainable tourism development that increases the economic and educational benefits from the tourism resources and maintains the cultural and environmental integrity of the host community;

(b) To support national efforts in developing countries and countries with economies in transition towards sustainable tourism development through relevant capacity-building activities as well as financial and technical assistance with regard to all aspects of tourism, including education in the field of tourism;

(c) To collect and disseminate information on best practices and techniques, including an appropriate mix of instruments to minimize negative and promote positive environmental and social impacts from tourism in developed and developing countries and in countries with economies in transition. This programme could also include the collection of disaggregated data on travel to determine the kinds of visitors to various countries and their needs;

(d) To promote the exchange of information on transportation, accommodation and other services, public awareness raising programmes and education, and various voluntary programmes. Possible forms of this information exchange should be explored in consultation with relevant partners. Utilization of means such as trade representations, tourist offices and the Internet should be considered;

(e) To undertake studies on appropriate measures for promoting sustainable tourism development;

(f) To clarify further the concept and definition of sustainable tourism and of ecotourism;

(g) To develop indicators for sustainable tourism, taking into account the work of the World Tourism Organization, as well as an ongoing testing phase of indicators for sustainable development;

(h) To undertake activities that would be mutually supportive to the preparations of the International Year of Ecotourism and International Year of Mountains, as well as activities of the International Coral Reef Initiative;

(i) To undertake a comprehensive survey and assessment of the existing voluntary initiatives relating to the economic, sociocultural and environmental sustainability of tourism within the context of the process on voluntary initiatives launched by the Commission on Sustainable Development at its sixth session;[11]

---

[10] United Nations Environment Programme, *Convention on Biological Diversity* (Environment Law and Institution Programme Activity Centre), June 1992.

[11] See *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1998, Supplement No. 9* (E/1998/29), chap. I, sect. B, decision 6/2.

(j) To consider establishing a global network to promote an exchange of information and views on ecotourism;

(k) To elaborate, in consultation with Governments, the private sector, labour associations, local authorities and other major groups, a comprehensive set of guidelines for sustainable tourism development aimed at ensuring that the development of tourism is consistent with the goals and principles of sustainable development which could be approved by the United Nations by 2002;

6. *Invites* the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity to further consider, in the context of the process of the exchange of experiences, existing knowledge and best practice on sustainable tourism development and biological diversity with a view to contributing to international guidelines for activities related to sustainable tourism development in vulnerable terrestrial areas, *inter alia*, mountains, and marine ecosystems and habitats of major importance for biological diversity and protected areas;

7. *Invites* the World Tourism Organization, World Travel and Tourism Council and the Earth Council as the authors of *Agenda 21 for the Travel and Tourism Industry* to develop modalities of assessment, monitoring and reporting to complement the work achieved thus far and to make the results available the Commission on Sustainable Development.

B. Co-Chairmen's summary of the discussions

Introduction

58. As an outcome of the nineteenth special session of the General Assembly for the overall review and appraisal of the implementation of Agenda 21 in 1997, the Assembly, in paragraph 69 of the annex to its resolution S/19-2 of 28 June 1997 on the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21, requested the Commission on Sustainable Development to develop an action-oriented international programme of work on sustainable tourism, to be defined in cooperation with the World Tourism Organization, the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity and other relevant bodies. More recently, the Assembly, in its resolution 53/200 of 15 December 1998, declared the year 2002 as the International Year of Ecotourism and, in its resolution 53/24 of 10 November 1998, declared 2002 as the International Year of Mountains. The Economic and Social Council, in its resolution 1998/40 of 30 July 1998, requested the Commission, in the framework of its discussion of tourism during its seventh session, to recommend to the Assembly, through the Council, supportive measures and activities which would contribute to a successful International Year of Ecotourism. Many delegations stressed that policy development and implementation should take place in cooperation with all interested parties, especially the private sector and local and indigenous communities, in the context of Agenda 21.

59. The discussions on tourism and sustainable development were based on the recommendations and proposals for action contained in the report of the Secretary-General on tourism and sustainable development and its three addenda (E/CN.17/1999/5 and Add.1–3). In addition, many delegations from developed and developing countries provided useful information on activities, policies and strategies in their countries pertaining to sustainable tourism development.

General considerations

60. Many delegations noted that tourism is both currently and potentially a significant contributor to sustained economic growth and sustainable development. In a number of developing countries, tourism has emerged as a dominant economic contributor, providing infrastructure development, jobs, foreign exchange earnings, government tax revenue and other significant benefits to local communities. Developing countries experience trying times with regard to not only environmental management, but also socio-economic welfare and tourism market growth. Uplifting people is the biggest challenge facing the tourism sectors of these countries, and the creation of sustainable job opportunities and the promotion of emerging enterprises, as well as appropriate training, are of cardinal importance.

61. Many delegations also noted that the tourism industry is one of the fastest growing economic sectors in the global economy and has important economic, social, cultural and environmental impacts. Many delegations noted that the continued growth of the tourism industry has important implications for the achievement of sustainable development, particularly in small island developing States and tourist destinations with fragile ecological environments.

62. Many countries emphasized that the tourism sector can be a major engine for economic development in many developing countries because of its large potential contribution to income- and employment-generation. Moreover, in some developing countries, particularly those lacking adequate resource endowments such as the small island developing States, tourism may be the only development alternative available in the short to medium term. However, there was some concern that over-reliance on tourism, especially mass tourism, carries significant risks to tourism-dependent economies since phenomena such as economic recession and natural disasters can have devastating effects on the tourism sector.

63. Many delegations noted that international tourism can potentially introduce both positive and negative social and cultural impacts in host destinations. Although tourism can create positive impacts on social development through employment creation, income redistribution and poverty alleviation, it also has the potential to introduce negative social and cultural change such as through drug abuse, child labour, prostitution, overcrowding, pressure on resources, and challenges to established culture.

64. Many delegations stated that an important consideration in sustainable tourism development is the tourist carrying capacity of host destinations in both environmental and social terms which should adequately reflect the ability of a local community to absorb tourists without submerging or overwhelming the local culture and its natural resources.

65. Many countries also stated that the tourism industry can present serious challenges to environmental management, particularly through its consumption of resources, the pollution and waste generated by the development of tourism infrastructures and facilities, transportation and tourist activities. In the absence of proper planning and management, tourism development can encourage the intensive or inappropriate use of land which can lead to deforestation, soil erosion and loss of biological diversity. Ironically, damage to the environment threatens the very viability of the tourism industry because tourism depends heavily on the natural environment.

66. Coastal area development for tourism was identified as an issue of particular concern by many countries. Improperly planned development of tourism can despoil the pristine beauty of coastal areas, contribute to beach destruction and coastal degradation and negatively affect the livelihood of peoples in coastal communities. The treatment and disposal of liquid and solid wastes generated by the tourism industry were identified as a serious problem, particularly for less developed economies that lack the appropriate physical

infrastructure or adequate waste treatment capacity. The disposal of untreated effluents into surrounding areas of land and sea often leads to the pollution of scarce inland freshwater resources, loss of valuable marine life, destruction of coral reefs and the silting and erosion of coastal beaches.

67. Some delegations, noting that the United Nations had declared 2002 as the International Year of Mountains, pointed out that opportunities exist for obvious linkages with the International Year of Ecotourism, also in 2002. Mountain regions represent a significant portion of the tourism industry. These remote, fragile and highly biodiverse ecosystems are homes to unique cultures and traditions which draw tourists from an increasingly urbanized world. If it is not properly managed, and does not take into account local communities, local control of resources, the integral role of women, equitable distribution of benefits and appropriate infrastructure needs, tourism development in mountain regions threatens to undermine ecosystems and cultures.

68. Many countries emphasized that fresh water remains a pressing concern. Since the tourism industry is an extremely intensive user of fresh water, the problem of freshwater supply could worsen as the industry expands globally unless steps are taken to minimize water use in accommodation and other tourism activities. Some other delegations noted that, although the tourism sector is only a minor contributor to global warming, air pollution could worsen at the global level, for example, from increased carbon dioxide (CO^2) emissions related to energy use in tourism-related transportation, and air-conditioning and heating of tourism facilities.

69. Many countries also emphasized that the tourism industry can help protect and rehabilitate natural assets, such as parks, protected areas and cultural and natural sites, by its financial contributions, provision of environmental infrastructure and improved environmental management. It can also help to raise the awareness of the local population regarding the financial and intrinsic value of natural and cultural sites, motivating communities to reclaim their natural and cultural patrimony through environmental protection and conservation. In general, the tourism industry has a vested interest in maintaining the environmental, social and cultural resources of destination areas which represent their core business assets.

70. There was an attempt by many delegations to define sustainable tourism. One delegation suggested that sustainable tourism is, *inter alia*, development which "... meets the need of present tourists and host regions while protecting and enhancing opportunity for the future". Other delegations suggested that "sustainable tourism must seek a balance between (a) economic benefit and investment; (b) social participation, including local communities, with direct earnings, and seeking preservation and consolidation of its cultural values and traditions; (c) conservation and protection of environment and biological diversity, taking into account regulations that allow an appropriate management of habitats and the introduction of education and dissemination of information to promote an environmental consciousness among the local population and visitors". One delegation noted that ecotourism is an economic activity that minimizes environmental impacts, valuing and contributing to the conservation of ecosystems, and at the same time generates incomes for local communities.

71. One delegation noted that ecotourism has potential to create new patterns of tourism but, at the same time, there are impediments to promoting ecotourism which include local communities' hesitation to replace conventional tourism, the reluctance to adopt codes of conduct to ensure the quality of ecotourism and the difficulty of promoting ecotourism in areas unlikely to attract visitors.

Challenges

72. Delegations noted that there are a number of important challenges associated with sustainable tourism development. These challenges include, *inter alia*, the following:

(a) A concentration of services and profits into very few big transnational corporations, which often leads to the development of enclaves with no linkage to other socio-economic sectors of the local society;

(b) The lack of an adequate tourism infrastructure, which was seen as a serious obstacle to tourism development in some countries, particularly developing countries;

(c) The need to improve the access of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) to government incentives and publicity;

(d) The need to involve local communities, at all levels, in all aspects of the tourism development process, such as policy-making, planning, management, ownership and the sharing of benefits;

(e) The need to ensure that tourism development planning preserves the natural and cultural legacy, heritage and integrity of tourism destinations and respects the social and cultural norms of society, particularly among the indigenous communities;

(f) The need to inform people of the benefits to be gained from sustainable tourism development through community awareness campaigns;

(g) The need to raise public awareness about sustainable tourism and to encourage more responsible behaviour among tourists;

(h) The need to enhance the linkages of the private tourism sector with the other sectors of the economy, and to ensure that domestic entrepreneurs are not marginalized by foreign investors in the tourism industry;

(i) To ensure sufficient coordination between the public and private sectors to achieve sustainable tourism;

(j) To overcome the lack of regional cooperation for promoting the development of sustainable tourism.

Action by Governments

73. Many delegations stressed that Governments should give appropriate attention and priority to tourism in development planning so that it develops in harmony with overall economic, social and environmental goals, within an integrated policy framework. In this regard, Governments should develop national strategies or master plans for tourism, in the context of Agenda 21, which will provide focus and direction to all stakeholders.

74. Some delegations stated that countries should consider the various options available for financing tourism infrastructure projects, such as government outlays, financing by multilateral and regional financial institutions, involvement of the private sector through build-operate-transfer schemes, and foreign direct investment (FDI). In addition, there are also various options for private sector financing for, *inter alia*, training, education, management and marketing.

75. Some countries noted that the use of economic instruments to promote sustainable tourism, in particular the full-costing and pricing of energy and water, can promote eco-efficiency in the tourism industry as well as provide additional revenue that can be used to support improved management of these resources. In this regard, the polluter-pays

principle and user-pays systems are appropriate and should be more widely applied and supported.

76. Many delegations were of the view that government policies should be implemented to encourage and support small and medium-sized enterprises in the tourism industry, especially in developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

77. Many delegations stressed that Governments should promote partnerships between all stakeholders and that they can play an important role by encouraging, supporting and facilitating the involvement and commitment of all stakeholders, especially indigenous and local communities, in the planning, development and management of tourism.

78. Many delegations emphasized that there needs to be an increase in the transfer of the benefits from tourism to local communities through the creation of jobs, entrepreneurial opportunities and social benefits if efforts to promote community participation are to be effective.

79. Some countries emphasized that, in some cases, there is a need to control the rate of growth of the tourism sector in order to preserve the natural and cultural legacy, heritage and integrity of tourism destinations as well as the social and cultural norms of society, particularly among the indigenous communities.

80. Many countries noted that it is necessary to promote capacity-building in sustainable tourism, particularly among local governments. In many countries, local governments have important responsibilities for tourism development and management, and capacity-building programmes will enable them to better understand these responsibilities with respect to sustainable tourism.

81. Some delegations pointed out that local and central governments should enhance their capacity to monitor the performance of the tourism industry and to develop suitable indicators of sustainable tourism that can be used in their decision-making.

82. Many delegations stressed that Governments should promote the role of the local community in deciding what it is prepared to offer, how its cultural patrimony is to be presented and which, if any, aspects of the culture are off-limits to visitors.

83. Some delegations suggested that tourism, in particular mass tourism, should be regulated and, where necessary, prohibited in ecologically and culturally sensitive areas. In protected areas and where nature is particularly diverse, vulnerable and attractive, tourism should be permitted only where it meets the requirements of nature protection and biological diversity conservation. In coastal areas where tourism can impose serious environmental damage, the principles of integrated coastal area management should be implemented. Environmental impact studies are an important tool for sustainable development and should be undertaken.

84. Many delegations noted that sustainability issues should be fully integrated into courses at all levels of education in order to develop environmental awareness and the skills required to promote sustainable tourism. In this regard, it is also important to raise public awareness about sustainable tourism and to encourage more responsible behaviour among tourists.

85. Many countries emphasized that there is a need for further efforts to prevent and control tourism-related abuse and exploitation of people, particularly women and children and other disadvantaged groups. Some delegations felt that both sending and receiving countries had roles to play in combating this serious negative impact of international tourism.

Action by the private sector

86. Many delegations stated that the tourism industry should ensure that their investment, employment, operational and other business decisions take full account of the wider implications of such actions for the long-term development and economic sustainability of the destinations in which they operate.

87. Some countries suggested that the tourism industry, by modifying the products it develops and offers the public, can directly influence the nature of tourism itself, directing it towards sustainable forms of tourism. Marketing can be used to enhance the industry's initiatives for promoting sustainable development by, *inter alia*, raising awareness among their clients of the potential environmental and social impacts of their holidays, and of responsible behaviour. In some countries, the tourism industry is also increasingly interested in eco-labels as a means of promoting those countries' facilities and destinations. Some delegations cautioned, however, that the concept of eco-labelling and related issues are still under consideration by the Committee on Trade and Environment of the World Trade Organization.

88. Many delegations urged tourism enterprises to integrate environmental management systems and procedures into all aspects of corporate activity. This would necessitate the implementation of, *inter alia*, environmental and social audits, and training of staff in the principles and practices of sustainable tourism management. Tourism enterprises were also urged to take all appropriate measures to minimize all forms of waste, conserve energy and fresh-water resources, and control harmful emissions to all environmental media, as well as minimize the potential environmental impacts from tourism development, for example, by using local materials and technologies appropriate to local conditions. The tourism industry was encouraged to promote wider implementation of environmental management, particularly among small- and medium-sized enterprises.

89. Many delegations noted that the tourism industry had developed a number of environmental codes of conduct and other voluntary initiatives in support of sustainable tourism. It was suggested that an inventory and assessment should be made of such voluntary initiatives on the part of industry, and improvements in the monitoring and reporting of industry's progress towards the objective of sustainable tourism. Some delegations requested the preparation of an inventory of all existing codes of conduct, guidelines and voluntary initiatives concerning sustainable tourism.

Action by the international community

90. Many delegations stressed the need for the international community to promote the recognition of the value of tourism as an economic tool for development, particularly for developing countries, and the fragility of the resources on which it depends, as well as the resulting need for international support to encourage its sustainable development.

91. Many delegations were of the view that international organizations and donor countries should increase their efforts in training and capacity-building in the field of tourism in developing countries, and that studies should be carried out on specific issues of interest to developing countries. Technical and financial assistance to developing countries is critical to enable them to develop competitive and sustainable tourism sectors.

92. Some delegations stated that the international, regional and multilateral agreements and guidelines that address the issue of sustainable tourism need to be effectively translated into practical programmes for implementation by the tourism industry, Governments and civil society. There is also a need to consolidate as well as enhance the monitoring of these initiatives.

93. Many delegations stressed that the international community has an important role to assist developing countries, in particular the least developed countries, economies in transition and small island developing States, through financial and technical assistance to Governments at all levels.

94. Many delegations also stressed that the international community should strengthen development cooperation to make tourism development more environmentally sustainable, while emphasizing financial support and measures to accelerate the transfer of environmentally sound technology to developing countries. Steps should be taken to facilitate the international exchange of information, experiences and technical skills, especially between the developed and developing countries. Some delegations said that international cooperation should make tourism sustainable in respect of its economic and social aspects as well.

95. Some delegations emphasized that regional cooperation is an important policy approach for promoting the development of sustainable tourism.

96. One delegation noted that, although it is important to allow for a variety of forms of ecotourism that depend on the regional situation, there are benefits to be derived from global standards to minimize negative ramifications of ecotourism and an international network to promote an exchange of information and views.

III. Adoption of the report of the Working Group

97. At the 9th meeting, on 26 February 1999, the Working Group had before it the draft report of its session (E/CN.17/ISWG.I/1999/L.1), as well as a number of informal papers.

98. At the same meeting, the Working Group took note of the informal papers and adopted its report.

IV. Organizational and other matters

A. Opening and duration of the session

99. The Inter-sessional Ad Hoc Working Group on Consumption and Production Patterns and on Tourism of the Commission on Sustainable Development met in New York from 22 to 26 February 1999, in accordance with Economic and Social Council decision 1998/295 of 31 July 1998. The Working Group held 9 meetings (1st to 9th meetings).

100. The session was opened by the temporary Chairman, George Talbot (Guyana), Vice-Chairman of the Commission on Sustainable Development.

B. Attendance

101. The session was attended by representatives of States members of the Commission on Sustainable Development. Observers from other States Members of the United Nations and for the European Community, and representatives of organizations of the United Nations system and secretariats of treaty bodies, as well as observers for intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, also attended.

C. Election of officers

102. At the 1st meeting, on 22 February, the Working Group elected by acclamation Navid Hanif (Pakistan) and Sándor Mózes (Hungary) as Co-Chairmen.

D. Agenda and organization of work

103. At the 1st meeting, on 22 February, after statements by the Co-Chairman and the representative of the United Nations Environment Programme, the Working Group adopted its provisional agenda as contained in document E/CN.17/ISWG.I/1999/1 and approved its organization of work. The agenda read as follows:

1. Election of officers.
2. Adoption of the agenda and other organizational matters.
3. Consumption and production patterns.
4. Tourism.
5. Other matters.
6. Adoption of the report of the Working Group.

E. Documentation

104. The Working Group had before it the following documents:

(a) Report of the Secretary-General entitled "Comprehensive review of changing consumption and production patterns" (E/CN.17/1999/2);

(b) Report of the Secretary-General on tourism and sustainable development (E/CN.17/1999/5);

(c) Report of the Secretary-General on tourism and sustainable development: tourism and economic development (E/CN.17/1999/5/Add.1);

(d) Report of the Secretary-General on tourism and sustainable development: tourism and social development (E/CN.17/1999/5/Add.2);

(e) Report of the Secretary-General on tourism and sustainable development: tourism and environmental protection (E/CN.17/1999/5/Add.3).